

**Tompkins County Industrial Development Agency
Board of Directors Meeting Final Minutes
October 14, 2020 at 2:30 PM
Via Zoom Conference Call and LiveStream**

Present: Rich John, Mike Sigler, Laura Lewis, Martha Robertson, Anne Koreman, John Guttridge, Jennifer Tavares

Staff Present: Heather McDaniel, Ina Arthur (TCAD), Russ Gaenzle (Harris Beach)

Guests Present: Andrew Bodewes and Tim Crilly (Park Grove Realty), Tony Votaw and Martin Stallone (Cayuga Medical Center), Bruce Adib-Yazdi and Rick Manzardo (Vecino Development Group)

CALL TO ORDER

Rich John called the meeting of the **Tompkins County IDA** to order at 2:40 pm.

PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR

Comments from the public were received via email and read into the minutes of the meeting by the Board Directors.

Rich John read the following comment from **Theresa Alt, 206 Eddy Street, City of Ithaca**

To the Industrial Development Agency:

I am both intrigued and puzzled by the set of applications before you from Carpenter Park, once a single project, now divided among three LLCs, all with the same development company and all applications signed by the same Andrew Bodewes.

The affordable building, Carpenter Park Apartments, LLC, is for sure a good idea and worthy of a PILOT.

I won't criticize the Carpenter Park Community Medical Center. Welcome back to the City, CMC!

What's troubling is Carpenter Park Mixed Use, LLC. It's market-rate housing with nothing affordable mixed in, now that the affordable part has become a separate project. So when this applicant refers to the other now-separated project as part of the rationale for the \$6,667,108 tax abatement package it seeks — and the affordable building is getting a PILOT — to me this sounds like double-dipping. Now that the projects are legally separate, this one had better stand on it's own. It is now a market-rate housing project with no workforce housing in it. So it does not comply with current standards. It does not deserve a tax abatement. As for the green claims, I keep hearing that the kinds of green features the project cites do not really add to the cost, when the savings in operation are taken into account. And there is not so great a percent of local labor in the plans.

So, Carpenter Park Mixed Use does not meet the basic standards for a tax abatement. Don't waste more time on it, unless you can require them to add the 20% affordable units that the City and the IDA want.

ADDITIONS TO THE AGENDA – Asteri Ithaca, LLC Revised Application

NEW BUSINESS

Carpenter Park – Applications

Three applications for this aggregate project were included in the agenda packet. While considered one project, three applications were submitted to address the differing funding sources and incentives requested.

Andy Bodewes of Park Grove Realty introduced the project. Park Grove Realty is partnering with Cayuga Medical Center. The four buildings proposed in the project are part of a single PUD in the City of Ithaca. There will be a building of affordable housing units, two market rate apartment buildings with first floor commercial space and a medical office. The project will also include relocation and upgrades to the existing community gardens.

Marty Stallone, MD, CEO of Cayuga Health Systems, spoke about the role of the medical office building. They are viewing this building as an access point to healthcare programs for City residents. There will be a walk-in clinic, lab and radiology facilities as well as primary and secondary caregiver offices.

Andy Bodewes addressed the question as to why they submitted three applications for one project. The affordable housing building PILOT will be modeled after the INHS affordable housing project and be based on a percentage of Net Operating Income (NOI). The two mixed use buildings will be asking for the CIITAP financial need/enhanced energy incentive. And the Medical office building will ask for a PILOT based on a fixed assessment (effectively keeping the building on the tax rolls). The three components have three separate financing streams. The affordable housing is all in one building due to the differing equity and funding sources. All the buildings will use the same materials with the affordable housing building incorporating triple glazed windows due to the closer proximity to the railroad tracks.

Martha Robertson asked about complying with the IDA's affordable housing policy. Heather McDaniel stated that as a whole the total project will be providing 20% of the housing units as affordable and thus will be meeting the affordable housing requirement. While three separate applications were submitted, the project owners will essentially be the same. It is not unusual to have different single purpose entities for different uses and in fact, would be required for the affordable housing tax credit portion of the project. The City of Ithaca has viewed this as one project with a single planned unit development application and approvals as well.

Martha Robertson asked about who would be providing the income qualifying for the affordable units. Andy Bodewes stated that the income qualifying for the affordable housing units will be done by Baldwin Management in association with DiMarco Group out of Rochester, NY. They have experience doing this.

John Guttridge asked if the three property parcels would be subdivided and have three separate ownership entities? Yes, there are three ownership entities due to the unique financing streams for each

part of the project but the ownership for each is substantially the same. The affordable building will have a tax credit investor that will become part of the ownership entity.

John Guttridge spoke to the IDA's newly adopted affordable housing policy and the requirement to either provide 20% of housing units as affordable or to contribute to the CHDF. If only the mixed-use housing building had come to the IDA they would need to contribute to the fund. He is not sure he agrees that this is one project. He has serious issues with this that will need to be worked out.

He asked what percentage of the medical building would be owned by Cayuga Medical Center? 100%. He also asked about the current location of the TCAT bus stop – it is currently across the street from the proposed affordable unit building in the Aldi's parking lot.

Anne Koreman stated that most of her questions had been asked and answered. She asked if there would be chargers for electric or hybrid cars? Yes, in front of the mixed-use building.

She stated that she is also struggling with the 3 vs. 1 project in terms of the affordable housing policy.

Jennifer Tavares stated that if one looks at this from a business perspective you could see why there are three applications for the three components of the project. And if you take the total housing units (208) you can see that the 42 affordable units meet the 20% affordable requirement per the IDA's policy. She does not see the need to separate the components and make each comply with the policy. This project is achieving a lot in terms of community benefit as is.

Laura Lewis commented that she appreciates the complexity of the project and agrees with Jennifer Tavares thoughts. She is also pleased that there will be a downtown medical building.

Rich John commented that looking at this project as a PUD on a single piece of land that will be built together and have community benefits that will be received together he does not see a problem considering this as one project.

Martha Robertson asked about the IDA's Diversity and Inclusion policy. Cayuga Medical Center (the major employer) will comply with the IDA's Diversity and Inclusion Policy.

Mike Sigler moved to accept the three applications as complete and to move the project to a public hearing. John Guttridge seconded the motion. The motion was approved 7-0.

Asteri Ithaca, LLC – Revised Application

Jennifer Tavares recused herself from the discussion and voting on the Asteri Ithaca, LLC application as she is directly involved with the Conference Center component of the application.

Heather McDaniel outlined the revised application for this project that was previously presented to the Board at the August Board meeting. The square footage and number of housing units have been reduced as well as the total project costs. A taxable bond-financing component has also been added. She asked that the Board consider the revised application as complete and move it to a public hearing.

John Guttridge moved to accept the revised Asteri Ithaca, LLC application as complete and to send it to a public hearing. Laura Lewis seconded the motion. The motion was approved 6-0-1 (Jennifer Tavares abstaining).

TCIDA Emergency COVID 19 Grant Program

Heather McDaniel presented the Emergency COVID 19 Grant Program that would allow the TCIDA to make grants up to \$10,000 to childcare programs for purchases and renovations relating to operating under the COVID 19 pandemic conditions. The Board revised the authorizing resolution to reflect having staff review applications and make recommendations directly to the Board for approval.

John Guttridge moved to approve the TCIDA Emergency COVID 19 Grant Program as amended. Jennifer Tavares seconded the motion. The motion was approved 7-0.

2021 TCIDA Budget - Approval

John Guttridge moved to approve the 2021 TCIDA Budget as presented. Anne Koreman seconded the motion. The motion was approved 7-0.

OLD BUSINESS

Labor Committee Appointment

Martha Robertson moved to approve appointing Tim Logue to the TCIDA Local Labor Committee as the representative from the City of Ithaca. John Guttridge seconded the motion. The motion was approved 7-0.

CHAIRS REPORT – None.

STAFF REPORT – Heather McDaniel reported that the Common Council of the City of Ithaca voted to eliminate the two-step process for the CIITAP application process. Moving forward, applicants for this program will only need to apply to and work with the TCIDA.

The Local Labor Committee will be meeting on October 20, 2020.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES – **Mike Sigler made a motion to approved the September 12, 2020 Board meeting minutes. Anne Koreman seconded the motion. The motion was approved 7-0.**

ADJOURNMENT – The meeting was adjourned at 4:10 pm.

Minutes were approved at the December 9, 2020 Board meeting.